

Exhibit 6.1: Ranking Character-Defining Features Table of Contents

Table of Contents

Ranking Criteria	1
A. Craftsmanship	1
B. Conveying Significance	1
C. Public Benefit.....	1
D. Visibility and transparency.....	1
E. Integrity	2
Point Range (Optional).....	2
Properties Within Historic Districts.....	2
Criteria Matrix.....	4
Examples	5
Individually Eligible Historic Property	5
Individually Eligible Historic Property	5
Eligible and Listed Historic District	6
Contributing Property in Markham Place Historic District	8
Contributing Property in Markham Place Historic District	8

Exhibit 6.1: Ranking Character-Defining Features

When projects affect historic properties, it is typically necessary to determine which features are most important to preserve in order avoid or minimize harm, to develop appropriate mitigation measures, or to determine whether proposed rehabilitation, preservation, maintenance and other activities are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's [Treatment of Historic Properties](#). To assist in this effort, Caltrans, in consultation with SHPO, developed a system for assessing and ranking character defining features.

This guidance is based on the National Park Service (NPS) [Preservation Brief 17: Architectural Character - Identifying the Visual Aspects of Historic Buildings as an Aid to Preserving Their Character](#) and NPS National Register Bulletin ["How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation."](#) Character-defining feature forms can be found on the Caltrans [cultural templates website](#). Contact CSO for additional guidance.

Ranking Criteria

A. Craftsmanship

- High: high artistic value, craftsmanship, design, materials
- Medium: expected feature linked to contributing architectural style or method of construction
- Low: standard historic fabric (commonly found during period of significance)

B. Conveying Significance

- High: quintessential & indispensable (without it significance is lost)
- Medium: important (without it significance is diminished)
- Low: little effect (but adverse effects could be cumulative)

C. Public Benefit

- High: public has the opportunity to use or enjoy with little or no effort (outdoor public space, feature or access, public building, etc.)
- Medium: public has the opportunity to use or enjoy but with some effort (semi-public outdoor space, building or feature with occasional access)
- Low: public has little or no opportunity to use or enjoy (mostly private spaces)

D. Visibility and transparency

- High: Primary, salient feature (e.g., something you can see from the street or public space)

- Medium: Secondary, somewhat obscured (e.g., something you can see through doors or windows)
- Low: Tertiary/obscured (e.g., private space that is not visible)

E. Integrity

- High: Intact as designed/original
- Medium: Somewhat altered but still conveys significance
- Low: Substantially altered; no longer conveys significance

Point Range (Optional)

Caltrans developed an optional point system for ranking character-defining features. While assigning points to achieve a ranking is typically not necessary, it may be useful in certain circumstances, such as when features are borderline.

Points in each of the above ranking criteria would be “high” equals 5 points, “medium” equals 2 points, and “low” equals 1 point. Total points for the combined ranking criteria are “high” equals 15 points, “medium” equals 10 points and “low” equals 5 points.

Total combined points for ranking character-defining features

- 13-15 points: Most Significant (strongly conveys sense of time and place)
- 9-12 points: Significant (conveys sense and place)
- 5-8 points: Less significant (still conveys sense of time and place, but to a lesser degree)
- Less than 5 points: Historic fabric, not character-defining feature

Properties Within Historic Districts

Before character-defining features can be identified and ranked for contributing properties within a historic district, it is necessary to identify the character-defining features of the district itself, as the district character-defining features serve as the framework for the contributing properties.

When determining the character-defining features for affected contributing buildings or structures, first look at the setting and environment for district features and note which environmental and landscape features are linked to the district (including spatial relationships, landscaping or vegetation, access points). Then look at all sides of the building or structure, noting its character-defining features. In most cases these features would be linked to the type, style or construction of the building or structure. Rear exteriors are rarely visible from the street or public access, nor do they have public benefit, so are rarely called

out as character-defining features. If the rear of contributing buildings or structures are visible by the public, such as from streets, alleys, or public walkways, the rear sides may be character-defining features.

Within a historic district, the character-defining features for contributing properties are linked to the character-defining features of the district. Often the features for the contributing property will rank higher for a specific property than for the district overall.

The contributing property's character-defining features are specific to the particular property and how it conveys the district's significance. The relative ranking, therefore – Most Significant, Significant and Less Significant – doesn't always match the district's character-defining feature significance. For example, the side driveway & detached garage of a house may be ranked as "Significant" features in a historic district, but ranked one of the "Most Significant" features in conveying how the house contributes to the district.

Criteria Matrix

Below is the set of criteria for ranking character-defining features in matrix form. It was used to identify and rank the features in the examples that follow.

CRITERIA MATRIX FOR RANKING CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES*

	HIGH = 3 POINTS	MEDIUM = 2 POINTS	LOW = 1 POINT
A. Craftsmanship	High artistic value, craftsmanship, design, materials	Expected feature linked to contributing architectural style or method of construction	Standard historic fabric (commonly found during period of significance)
B. Conveying Significance	Quintessential & Indispensable - (without it the significance is lost)	Important - (without it significance is diminished)	Low - (adverse effects could be cumulative)
C. Public Benefit	High	Medium	Low (mostly private spaces)
D. Visibility and transparency	Primary, salient feature (e.g., something you can see from the street or public space)	Secondary, somewhat obscured (e.g., something you can see through doors and windows)	Tertiary/obscured (e.g., private space that isn't visible)
E. Integrity	Intact as designed/original	Somewhat altered but still conveys significance	Substantially altered; no longer conveys significance
Total points in each category	15 points	10 points	5 points

RANKING

13 – 15 points =	Most significant:	Strongly conveys sense of time and place
9 – 12 points =	Significant:	Conveys sense of time and place
5 – 8 points =	Less significant:	Still conveys sense of time and place, but to lesser degree
< 5 points =	n/a	Historic fabric; not character-defining feature

Examples

The following examples include a property that is individually eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places (National Register), a National Register eligible historic district, and a contributing property within that historic district. It was first necessary to identify property-specific information, the qualifying National Register criteria, level and period of significance, boundaries, and reasons why the historic property qualifies for the National Register. Based on this information, the architectural historian identified the features that convey the historic property's significance and ranked them based on the matrix of criteria outlined above.

Individually eligible historic property

(National Register eligibility information)

Name	Mokelumne River Bridge	Date Determined Eligible/Listed	2003
Location	SR 12	Period of Significance	1941-42
Criteria	A, C	# of Properties	1
Significance Level		# of Non Contributors	N/A
# of Contributors	N/A	Architectural Style	Swing Truss

Architect/Builder California Div. of Highways and Transportation

Summary of Significance: The bridge is eligible for inclusion in the National Register under Criterion A for its association with the historical development of transportation in California's Delta Region, and eligible under Criterion C for its mechanical design and functional engineering.

Boundaries: The bridge itself.

Individually eligible historic property

(Character-defining features and how they have been ranked)

Ranking	CDF #	Character-Defining Feature Number and Description	A	B	C	D	E	Total points
M	1	Steel riveted through truss, including curved portal elements on the west and east ends of the structure, bracing members, and stringers	3	3	3	3	3	15
S	2	Control house (including metal siding, corrugated metal roof, concrete flooring, fenestration patterns and openings)	2	3	2	3	2	12
S	3	General Electric Generator	2	2	2	2	3	11
S	4	Bridge controller platform, hand brake, and control panel	2	2	2	2	3	11
S	5	Electrical cabinet and air compressor	2	2	2	2	3	11
S	6	No. 45 Concrete Pier (in center of bridge)	1	2	2	3	3	11
S	7	Concrete deck	2	2	2	2	2	10
S	8	Original bathroom (now storage closet)	2	2	2	1	2	9
L	9	Dolphins and fenders	1	1	2	2	2	8

Eligible and listed historic district

(National Register eligibility information)

Name of District Markham Place Historic District **Date Determined Eligible** 3/31/83 - Listed 3/07/13

Criteria A, C **Period of Significance** 1887-1935

Significance Level Local **# of Properties** 70

of Contributors 61 **Number of Non Contributors** 9

Summary of Significance: Criterion A: community planning; criterion C: architecture. Dense concentration of residential buildings in a variety of styles, nearly all designed by noted architects before WWI; many of the houses were designed by Frederick L. Roehrig. Mature landscaping, period street furniture and park unify district.

District Boundaries: City of Pasadena. Roughly bounded by Markham & Congress Places, Bellefontaine St., Pasadena & St. John Aves.

Eligible and listed historic district

(Character-defining features and how they have been ranked)

Markham Place Historic District

Ranking	Character Defining Feature	A	B	C	D	E	Total points
Most significant	Large, mostly two-story architect-designed homes (40 of the 61 contributors designed by noted and local architects) and the architectural features that define the particular architectural styles of the district.	3	3	3	3	5	15
Most significant	Houses on S. Pasadena Ave. consistently have deeper setbacks and are built on elevated berms.	3	3	3	3	3	15
Most significant	Roof height & type are consistent: mostly asymmetrical and gabled.	3	3	3	3	2	14
Most significant	Open landscaping with high visibility into the homes through size and pattern of fenestration and doorways, plus Craftsman characteristic of blending interior and exterior spaces.	2	3	3	3	3	14
Most significant	Cobblestone (river rock) retaining walls, pillars, porch piers and walls.	3	3	3	2	3	14
Most significant	Planting strips have consistent setbacks, are bordered by early 20 th century narrow scored sidewalks and contain evenly spaced street trees; trees vary from block to block.	2	3	3	3	3	14
Most significant	Predominance of organic materials in buildings & structures (e.g. wood siding)	2	3	3	3	2	13
Most significant	Consistent setbacks and lot size with houses oriented to the street.	2	3	2	3	3	13
Most significant	Along S. St. John Ave. open porches form a consistent linear pattern (consistent and even porch openings).	2	3	3	3	2	13
Most significant	Singer Park is major open space anchoring northwest corner of the district.	2	3	3	3	2	13
Most significant	Street lights are the same on a given street, but vary from plain concrete aggregate poles with round globes, to fluted smooth concrete aggregate columns with simple capitals and round globes or acorn globes.	2	2	3	3	2	12
Most significant	Rows of mature, slender palm trees along street frontage (early 20 th century landscape planning element).	2	2	3	3	2	12
Most significant	Side driveways lead to detached garages at the rear of the property. Some driveways are two-track with grass or pebble rock infill.	2	3	2	2	2	11
Most significant	Mature landscaping features (yard trees, shrubs in banks and along facades, front lawns).	1	2	3	3	2	11
Significant	Scattered low hedges, open (picket, etc.) fences define property lines but do not obscure visibility.	1	2	2	3	2	10
Significant	Pedestrian access includes footpaths from side driveways to front door and from sidewalk to front door.	1	1	2	2	2	8
Significant	Street curbs are distinctive early 20 th century concrete with deep, curved cuts at street intersections and driveways.	1	1	1	2	3	8

Contributing Property in Markham Place Historic District

(National Register eligibility information)

Historic Name N/A
Address 650 S. St. John Ave., Pasadena
Parcel Number 48234
Name of District Markham Place Historic Dist.
☐ Individually Eligible
☒ District Contributor

Architectural Style Craftsman Bungalow
Architect/Builder Edward C. Kent / W.C. Stevens
Date of Construction 1906
Interior Character Defining Features? ☐ Yes ☒ No
Final Disposition - Post Construction
☐ Return to original site ☒ Remain on site (possible part take)
☐ Reconstruct ☐ Relocate
☐ Unknown at this time ☐ Demolish

Contributing Property in Markham Place Historic District

(Character-defining features and how they have been ranked)

Contributing Property in Markham Place Historic District

Ranking	Character Defining Feature and Description	Corresponding District CDF#
M	One and one-half story Craftsman residence located mid-block on medium-sized lot with setback that is consistent to the district	1,3,4,7,9
M	Landscape features include mature street trees	4,12,14
M	Complex, asymmetrical form with multiple moderately pitched intersecting gables	1,3
M	Roof eaves are open with exposed rafters, large knee braces, and batten siding within the gable ends	1,3,7
M	Two large window boxes with brackets and bracketed window overhangs	1,7,4
M	Natural material of shingle siding	7
M	Primary (west) façade is asymmetrical with moderate transparency quotient	1,4,7
M	Primary (west) façade windows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Window A: Two pairs of wood-cased casement windows with 6 lights each leaf and side surrounds Window B: Four pairs of wood-cased casement windows with 6/1 lights in Craftsman pattern each leaf (set on first story, protrudes from façade) 	1,4,7
S	Side (south) elevation is asymmetrical with moderate transparency quotient	1,4,7
S	Side (south) elevation main entry is an oversized door of quarter sawn oak, with original hardware and original screen door	1,4,7
S	Side (south) elevation secondary entry is one pair of French doors with Craftsman-pattern lights	1,4,7
S	Side (south) elevation windows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Window F: One wood-cased fixed/double-hung/fixed bay window with 10/1-3/1-10/1 lights in Craftsman pattern Window G: One wood-cased 3-part casement/fixed/casement windows with 8-1-8 lights in Craftsman pattern Window H: One wood-cased 3-part casement window with a pair of casements at the center flanked by single casements, with 2/1 lights each pane in Craftsman pattern Window I: One pair of wood-cased casement windows with 2/1 lights in Craftsman pattern Window I-1: 4-light wood slider on sleeping porch 	1,4,7
S	Deck entry porch with wood rail on side (south) elevation	1,4,7
S	Side (north) elevation is asymmetrical with low transparency quotient	1,4,7

Exhibit 6.1: Ranking Character-Defining Features

S	Two glazed and paneled Craftsman doors on the side (north) elevation	1,4,7
S	Side (north) elevation windows: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Window J: Two pair of wood-cased casement windows with 6 lights each leaf• Window K: Four paired wood-cased casement windows with 2/1 lights each leaf in Craftsman pattern• Window L: One wood-cased triple fixed window with a single pane each leaf• Window M: One wood-cased casement window with 6 lights• Window N: Two pair of wood-cased casement windows with 2/1 lights each leaf in Craftsman pattern• <u>Window N-1</u>: Two openings on second sleeping porch	1,4,7