## Exhibit 2.8: National Register and California Register Comparison

The National Register of Historic Places criteria and the California Register of Historical Resources Criteria and the implementing regulations, which Caltrans uses to determine whether a resource is a historical resource under CEQA, are similar. The table below compares the federal and state guidelines. Boldfaced sections are for emphasis.

CALIFORNIA REGISTER LAW AND REGULATIONS	NR BULLETIN – HOW TO APPLY THE NATIONAL REGISTER CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION
CRITERIA	CRITERIA
<u>Law</u>	<u>Law</u>
States that the California Register criteria are the same as the National Register criteria. [PRC 5024.1(c)]	No criteria are included in the law.[Public Law 89-665, 16 USC 470 et seq.]
Regulations	Regulations
"These criteria are consistent with National Register criteria, but have been modified for state use in order to include a range of historical resources which better reflect the history of California." (CCR 4852)	"The quality of significance-in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:
"A resource may be listed as an historical resource in the California Register if it meets any of the following National Register of Historic Places criteria:	
(1) Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of California's history and cultural heritage.	(A) That are associate with <i>EVENTS</i> that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
(2) Is associated with the lives of <b>PERSONS</b> important in our past.	(B) That are associated with the lives of <b>PERSONS</b> significant in our past; or
(3) Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region, or method of construction, or represents the work of an important creative individual, or possess high artistic values.	(C) That embody the distinctive characteristics of a TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION, or that represent the WORK OF A MASTER, or that possess HIGH ARTISTIC VALUES, or that represent a significant and DISTINGUISHABLE ENTITY WHOSE COMPONENTS MAY LACK INDIVIDUAL DISTINCTION; or
(4) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, INFORMATION IMPORTANT in prehistory or history." [PRC 5024.1(c)]	(D) That have yielded, or may be likely to yield, <i>INFORMATION IMPORTANT</i> in prehistory or history. [36 CFR 60.4]

2024 Update rev: 12/20/24

CALIFORNIA REGISTER LAW AND REGULATIONS	NR BULLETIN – HOW TO APPLY THE NATIONAL REGISTER CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION
INTEGRITY  Law There is no mention of integrity in the legislation.  Regulations The California Register regulations do address integrity. But, they do not state that the California Register is more inclusive or has a lower threshold of signifi-	INTEGRITY  Law  There is no mention of integrity in the legislation.  Regulations  "The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and ob-
cance than the National Register.	jects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association[36 CFR 60.4]  "Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its sig-
"Integrity is the authenticity of an historical resource's physical identity evidenced by the survival of characteristics that existed during the resources' period of significance.	nificanceHistoric properties either retain their integrity or they do not."  Guidance for assessing integrity is in National Register Bulletin 15, Section VIII.
Historical resources eligible for listing in the California Register must:  -meet one of the criteria of significance described in CCR 4852(b) of this chapter and  - retain enough of their historic character or appearance to be recognizable as historical resources and to convey the reasons for their significance.  Historical resources that have been rehabilitated or restored may be evaluated for listing." [CCR 4852 (c)]	"Integrity is based on significance: why, where and when a property is important. Only after significance is fully established can you proceed to the issue of integrityUltimately the question of integrity is answered by whether or not the property retained the identify for which it is significant." [Section VIII]  "All properties change over time. It is not necessary for a property to retain all its historic physical features or characteristics.  The property must retain, however, the essential physical features that enable it to convey its historic identity. These essential physical features are those features that define both why a property significant (Applicable criteria and Areas of Significance) and when it was significant (Periods of Significance). They are features without which a property can no longer be identified as, for instance, a late 19 <sup>th</sup> century dairy barn or an early 20 <sup>th</sup> century commercial district."  [Section VIII]
"Integrity is evaluated with regard to the retention of:  - Design - Location - Setting - Materials - Workmanship - Feeling - Association	"The quality of significanceis present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of:  - Location - Design - Setting - Materials - Workmanship - Feeling - Association

## CALIFORNIA REGISTER LAW AND REGULATIONS NR BULLETIN – HOW TO APPLY THE NATIONAL **REGISTER CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION INTEGRITY (CONTINUED) INTEGRITY (CONTINUED)** It must also be judged with reference to the particu-"To retain historic integrity a property will always poslar criteria under which a resource is proposed for sess several, and usually most, of the aspects. The eligibility." [CCR 4852 (c)] retention of specific aspects of integrity is paramount for a property to convey its significance. **Determining** "Alterations over time to a resource or historic which of these aspects are most important to a parchanges in its use may themselves have historical, ticular property requires knowing why, where, and cultural, or architectural significance." when the property is significant." [Section VIII] [CCR 4852 (c)] Provides guidance for evaluating integrity under each of the four eligibility criteria. As with the California Register regulations, the National Register recognizes that alterations and changes in a property's use over time may themselves have significance. This is expressed most clearly under Criterion C "A **property can be significant** not only for the way it was originally constructed or created, but also for the way it was adapted at a later period, or for the way it illustrates changing tastes attitudes, and uses over a period of time." [Section VI] **ELIGIBILITY FOR INFORMATION POTENTIAL -ELIGIBILITY FOR INFORMATION POTENTIAL -**WHEN INTEGRITY LACKING WHEN INTEGRITY LACKING Law Law Eligibility under Criterion 4 when integrity is lacking is Eligibility under Criterion D when integrity is lacking is not mentioned in the law. not mentioned in the law. California Register law states under criterion 4, a resource may be listed if it: "Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history." [PRC 5024.1(c)(4)] Language between the law and the regulations is different. The language in PRC 5024.1 is closer to the National Register language. **Regulations** Regulations "The assessment of integrity for properties considered Language is similar to the guidance in National Register Bulletin 15 regarding eligibility under National for information potential depends on the data require-Register Criterion D when there is a lack of integrity ments of the applicable research design. under the other criteria. [CCR Title 14 Chapter 11.5 Section 4852(c)]

CALIFORNIA REGISTER LAW AND REGULATIONS	NR BULLETIN – HOW TO APPLY THE NATIONAL REGISTER CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION
ELIGIBILITY FOR INFORMATION POTENTIAL – WHEN INTEGRITY LACKING (CONTINUED)	ELIGIBILITY FOR INFORMATION POTENTIAL – WHEN INTEGRITY LACKING (CONTINUED)
"It is possible that historical resources may not retain sufficient integrity to meet the criteria for listing in the National Register, but they may still be eligible for listing in the California Register.	A property possessing information potential does not need to recall visually an event, person, process, or construction technique. It is important that the significant data contained in the property remain sufficiently intact to yield the expected important information, if the appropriate study techniques are employed." [Criterion D – Section VI]
A resources that has lost its historic character or appearance may still have sufficient integrity for the California Register if it maintains the potential to yield significant scientific or historical information or specific data." [CCR 4852 (c)]	"For properties eligible under Criterion D, including archeological sites and standing structures studied for their information potential, less attention is given to their overall condition, than if they were being considered under criteria A, B, or C." [Section VIII]
	"Criterion D has two requirements which must both be met for a property to qualify,
	<ul> <li>"The property must have, or have had, information to contribute to our understanding of human history or prehistory, and</li> <li>the information must be considered important." [Section VI]</li> </ul>
The California Register Regulations uses the term "significant scientific or historical information or specific data," but does not define it.	NRB 15 uses the term "important information potential" and provides definitions and guidance in Section VI.
SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS	CRITERIA CONSIDERATIONS
RELIGIOUS PROPERTIES, BIRTHPLACES, GRAVES, CEMETERIES & COMMEMORATIVE PROPERTIES	RELIGIOUS PROPERTIES, BIRTHPLACES, GRAVES, CEMETERIES & COMMEMORATIVE PROPERTIES
<u>Law</u>	<u>Law</u>
Not mentioned in the law.	Not mentioned in the law.
Regulations  These resources fall under the category of "Special Considerations" in the regulations.	Regulations  These resources are considered "Criteria considerations." Criteria considerations are usually expressed in lower case letters in parentheses. For Example, "Criteria Consideration (a)."

## CALIFORNIA REGISTER LAW AND REGULATIONS NR BULLETIN – HOW TO APPLY THE NATIONAL **REGISTER CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION** RELIGIOUS PROPERTIES, BIRTHPLACES, GRAVES, RELIGIOUS PROPERTIES, BIRTHPLACES, GRAVES, **CEMETERIES & COMMEMORATIVE PROPERTIES CEMETERIES & COMMEMORATIVE PROPERTIES** (CONTINUED) (CONTINUED) The following properties may be listed in the California The following properties are not normally eligible un-Register: less they met some very specific measurements: [National Register Criteria Considerations a, c, d, f] religious properties religious properties [Consideration (a)] birthplaces graves birthplaces [Consideration (c)] graves [Consideration (c)] cemeteries commemorative resources cemeteries [Consideration (d)] commemorative properties [Consideration (f)] California Register criteria have no exceptions for properties achieving significance within the these types of properties. As long as they meet the cripast 50 years [Consideration (g)] teria in CCR 4852 (b)(1) through (4) and have integrity, they can be listed For **religious properties**, it is to "avoid any appearance of judgment by government about the validity of any religion or belief." (Section VII) Birthplaces and graves may be "temporally and geographically far removed from the person's significant activities, and therefore are not usual considered eligible." (Section VII) "Cemeteries serve as a primary means of an individual's recognition of family history and as expressions of collective religious and/or ethnic identity." However, if cemeteries "embody values beyond personal or family-specific emotions, the national Register criteria allow for listing of cemeteries under certain conditions." (Section VII) Commemorative properties are "not directly associated with the event or with the person's productive life but serve as evidence of a later generation's assessment of the past...[and] generally must be over fifty years old and must possess significance based on [their] own value, not on the value of the event or person being memorialized. " (Section VII) **MOVED BUILDING & STRUCTURES MOVED BUILDING & STRUCTURES** Law Law Not mentioned in the law. Not mentioned in the law. **Regulations** Regulations These resources fall under the category of "Special These resources fall under the category of "Special Considerations" in the regulations. Considerations" in the regulations.

2024 Update rev: 12/20/24

## **CALIFORNIA REGISTER LAW AND REGULATIONS** NR BULLETIN – HOW TO APPLY THE NATIONAL **REGISTER CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION MOVED BUILDING & STRUCTURES MOVED BUILDING & STRUCTURES** (CONTINUED) (CONTINUED) A **moved** building, structure or object that is otherwise A moved building, structure or object under National eligible "may be listed in the California Register if: Register criteria consideration (b) is usually not considered eligible for the National Register unless: it was moved to prevent its demolition at its former location and it is was moved prior to its period of signifiif the new location is compatible with the cance (and is significant at its new site), original character and use of the historical reis significant primarily for architectural value, source. is the surviving structure most importantly as-An historical resource should retain its historic feasociated with a historic person or event. tures and compatibility in orientation, setting, and general environment." [CCR 4852 (d)(1)] Guidance for applying criteria consideration (b) is in Section VII. [See also the definition of object under CCR 4852(a)(4).] **PROPERTIES LESS THAN 50 YEARS OLD PROPERTIES LESS THAN 50 YEARS OLD** Law Law Not mentioned in the law. Not mentioned in the law. Regulations Regulations These resources fall under the category of "Special A property that is less than fifty years old under Na-Considerations" in the regulations. tional Register criteria consideration (g) is usually not considered eligible for the National Register unless it A resource that is less than fifty years old "may be is of exceptional importance, a phrase that may be apconsidered for listing in the California Register if plied to the extraordinary importance of an event or to it can be demonstrated that sufficient time an entire category of resources so fragile that survivors has passed to understand its historical imof any are unusual. Guidance for applying criteria conportance" sideration (g) is in NRB 15, Section VII. it does not have to be exceptionally im-"Fifty years is a general estimate of the time needed portant. [CCR 4852 (d)(2)] to develop historical perspective and to evaluate significance." [NRB 15 Section VII] This section states that "in order to understand the historical importance of a resource, sufficient time "The necessary perspective can be provided by scholmust have passed to obtain a scholarly perspective arly research and evaluation, and must consider both on the events or individuals associated with the rethe historic context and the specific property's role in sources." that context." [NRB 15 Section VII]

CALIFORNIA REGISTER LAW AND REGULATIONS	NR BULLETIN – HOW TO APPLY THE NATIONAL REGISTER CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION
RECONSTRUCTED BUILDINGS	RECONSTRUCTED BUILDINGS
Law Not mentioned in the law.	Law Not mentioned in the law.
Regulations These resources fall under the category of "Special Considerations" in the regulations.  A reconstructed building (as opposed to structure or object) is not listed in the California Register under CCR 4852 (b)(1)-events, (2)-lives, (3)-distinctive characteristics, etc. A reconstructed building that is less than fifty years old "may be eligible if it embodies traditional building methods and techniques that play an important role in a community's historically rooted beliefs, customs, and practices, e.g., a Native American roundhouse." [CCR 4852 (d)(3)]  This is a broader interpretation than for reconstructions under the National Register, but it only applies to buildings, not structures, objects or districts.	Regulations A reconstructed property under National Register criteria consideration (e) is usually not considered eligible for the National Register unless it is accurately executed in a suitable environmental and presented in a dignified manner as part of a restoration master plan and when no other building or structure with the same association has survived. This applies mainly to reconstructions that are less than fifty years old because when they attain fifty years of age, they may qualify in their own right under any of the National Register criteria. Guidance for applying criteria consideration (e) is in NRB 15, Section VII.

Page E-2.8 - 7